

4 DCSE2003/3819/F - PROPOSED EXTENSIONS AND ALTERATIONS, GREAT HILLSHONE COTTAGE, GANAREW, MONMOUTH, NP25 3SS

For: Mr & Mrs W H Whittaker, 9 Bakers Way, Cannock, Staffordshire, WS12 4XZ

Date Received: 22nd December 2003 Ward: Kerne Bridge Grid Ref: 52817, 16979
Expiry Date: 16th February 2004

Local Member: Councillor Mrs. R. F. Lincoln

1. Site Description and Proposal

- 1.1 Great Hillshone Cottage lies in open countryside and the Area of Great Landscape Value, as defined in the Local Plan. It is situated to the north-west of the A40 Ganarew exit and to the west of Lewstone. Access is gained via a public bridleway, which passes to the north of the site. The land rises from the south-east to the north-west and the surrounding area comprises loose knit, sporadic development. On the opposite side of the track to the cottage is a modern stable building and to the south-west lie a barn converted to residential use and a large modern agricultural building, with a mobile home beyond.
- 1.2 The property is a detached, two storey cottage that has been altered and sits close to the south-western boundary of the site. A detached garage is sited to the north-west of the dwelling. There is a single storey addition to the front (south-eastern) elevation and a lean-to extension to the rear (north-western) elevation. Great Hillshone Cottage is rendered and painted white, with a slate roof. The majority of the residential curtilage lies to the east (front) of the property. At present the property has a kitchen, dining room, lounge, conservatory (with tiled roof) rear lobby and bathroom at ground floor, with three bedrooms over.
- 1.3 It is proposed to demolish the existing extension to the rear elevation, the bathroom and rear lobby, and erect a two storey extension to the rear elevation. The extension would comprise a two-storey section with a gable end to the rear elevation and a two-storey element with a mono-pitched roof extending from the existing roof eaves. Amended plans have been received which set the side elevation of the extension in from the original side gable end of the cottage and reduce the projection of the first floor. The extension would extend a maximum of 5 metres from the rear elevation of the original cottage, although only 3.5 metres of this length would be two storey. The extension would have a floor area of 58 square metres over both floors and would provide a utility room, study, W.C and hallway with a bedroom and landing area at first floor. The scheme proposes revisions to the existing internal layout of the property, namely the resiting of the staircase into the extension, currently it is in the dining room, and a bathroom at first floor. As a result the proposed extended property would have three bedrooms.

2. Policies

2.1 Planning Policy Guidance

PPG.1 - General Policy and Principles

- PPG.7 - The Countryside, Environmental Quality and Economic and Social Development

2.2 Hereford and Worcester County Structure Plan

- Policy H.20 - Housing in rural Areas
Policy CTC.9 - Development Criteria
Policy CTC.2 - Development in Areas of Great Landscape Value

2.3 South Herefordshire District Local Plan

- Policy GD.1 - General Development Criteria
Policy C.1 - Development within Open Countryside
Policy C.8 - Development within Area of Great Landscape Value
Policy SH.23 - Extensions to Dwellings

2.4 Unitary Development Plan (First Deposit Draft)

- Part 1
Policy S.2 - Development Requirements
- Part 2
Policy DR.1 - Design
Policy H.18 - Alterations and Extensions
Policy LA.2 - Landscape Character and Areas Least Resilient to Change

3. Planning History

- 3.1 None.

4. Consultation Summary

Statutory Consultations

- 4.1 No statutory or non-statutory consultations required.

Internal Council Advice

- 4.2 Head of Engineering and Transportation has no objections to the proposal, and advises that it would not appear to affect the public bridleway.

5. Representations

- 5.1 Ganarew Parish Council - Comments awaited
- 5.2 One letter of objection has been received from, The Reverend Gill Evans and Mr Gary Evans of Great Hillshone Barn. The main points raised are:
- applications should be considered according to strict criteria, as the site is in open countryside, overlooking the Wye Valley Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, within the Area of Great Landscape Value and open countryside.
 - seems the proposed increase in the size of the property is disproportionately large in relation to the size of plot.

- the south-western elevation of the property directly faces our main recreational/sitting out area. There are no windows on the gable end of the existing cottage, which is largely screened off by a high hedge of conifers. Proposal would roughly double the south-western elevation and introduce two windows and a partly glazed door, all of which would overlook us. The plans do not indicate that the evergreen screening would be retained.
- the proposed north-westerly elevation, from which the major part of our garden is overlooked also shows a substantial increase in fenestration and again retention of the evergreen screening is not shown.
- the cottage and our property receive a sub-metered water supply from Great Hillshone Farm. Even without the cottage being regularly occupied we have experienced appreciable fluctuation in water pressure, the demands of a much larger dwelling may cause greater problems.
- a larger property could generate heavier use on our common access track and would impair the poor quality of the track.
- we hope that the digging of foundations would not disturb the root system and viability of the large mature oak tree closest to the cottage, which is an invaluable asset in the relatively treeless surrounding landscape.

The full text of this letter can be inspected at Southern Planning Services, Blueschool House, Blueschool Street, Hereford and prior to the Sub-Committee meeting.

6. Officers Appraisal

- 6.1 The main considerations in the determination of this application are the principle of extending the dwelling and the acceptability of the scheme in respect of the impact upon the character and appearance of the original dwelling, the surrounding area and the effect on the residential amenity of the neighbouring property and the impact upon the public bridleway.
- 6.2 Policy H20 of the Structure Plan states that the extension of an existing dwelling, provided that in the resulting scheme the original dwelling would remain the dominant element, is an exception to the normal presumption against new residential development in the open countryside. The proposed extension would represent a subservient element of the original cottage, in terms of its size, siting and design. Therefore in principle the extension is acceptable in planning policy terms.
- 6.3 Policy SH23 of the Local Plan states that extensions to dwellings should be in keeping with the character of the existing dwelling in terms of mass, scale, design and materials. The gable end of the proposed extension would be the same span as that of the original cottage. In terms of the scale, mass and design of the extension it would complement the existing dwelling. The external materials would match the existing. Furthermore due to the siting the proposed extension would not impact upon the principal elevation. It is considered that the proposal fully accords with Policy SH23 of the Local Plan. Due to the siting of the extension the main area of garden would be entirely retained. It is considered that the resulting dwelling would not appear cramped or over large within the site.
- 6.4 As a result of the extension proposed the existing property would be enlarged. However due to its siting, to the rear of the dwelling, its subservient scale and its complementary design and materials it would not be unduly prominent in the rural landscape. Furthermore it would be near to other buildings of a larger scale. By virtue of its scale and sensitive design it is considered that the proposal would not adversely affect the Area of Great Landscape Value and as such accords with Policies CTC2 and C8 of the Structure Plan and Local Plan, respectively.

- 6.5 Great Hillshone Cottage and Great Hillshone Barn are orientated so that no elevations are directly facing one another. The cottage occupies higher land than the converted barn, but there is a distance of some 36 metres between the two properties. Furthermore between the curtilages of the properties is a parcel of land in a third parties' ownership, on which it is understood that the conifers are sited. One first floor window is proposed in the south-western elevation of the proposed extension, to serve the bedroom. Due to the orientation of the cottage to the objectors' property and the distance between the two dwellings it is considered that the provision of a window in the side elevation of the extension would not unacceptably impinge upon amenity. The second window and partially glazed door, to which the objectors' refer, would be at ground floor and due to the distance between the properties, the existing screening and the scope for further boundary landscaping by either party, their inclusion within the scheme would not adversely effect privacy. With regards the north western elevation of the extension the only first floor windows proposed in the extension would be two rooflights to provide light to the staircase. Due to the siting of this element of the extension it is considered that they would not overlook the objectors' garden, but rather would only provide limited views of the third parties land and the public right of way. A new window is shown on the submitted plans to serve an existing bedroom. This window would be in an original part of the dwelling and as such would constitute permitted development.
- 6.6 The potential for increased use of the private access track and water supply as a result of the proposed development is a matter between land owners/users. However it should be noted that the resulting dwelling would only have the same number of bedrooms as the existing and two additional toilets. Furthermore in respect of the access track, which is a public bridleway no objections are raised by the Head of Engineering and Transportation.
- 6.7 The proposed extension would not be nearer to the oak tree than the existing dwelling, nor would it be underneath the tree's canopy. It is therefore considered that the proposed development would not adversely impact upon the tree.

RECOMMENDATION

That planning permission be granted subject to the following conditions:

1. A01 (Time limit for commencement (full permission))

Reason: Required to be imposed by Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2. A09 (Amended plans)

Reason: To ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the amended plans.

3. B02 (Matching external materials (extension))

Reason: To ensure the external materials harmonise with the existing building.

Informative(s):

- 1. The Public Rights of Way Officer advises that the following points should be noted:

The right of way should remain open at all times throughout the development. If development works are perceived to be likely to endanger members of the public then a temporary closure order should be applied for from the Public Rights of Way Section, preferably 6 weeks in advance of work starting.

The right of way should remain at its historic width and suffer no encroachment or obstruction during the works or at any time after completion.

- 2. N15 - Reason(s) for the Grant of Planning Permission

Decision:

Notes:

.....

Background Papers

Internal departmental consultation replies.